



Legislation Text

File #: HPB Reso 13-2017, **Version:** 1

Agenda Date: August 21, 2017

Subject:

Resolution to approve a COA allowing changes to 2670 and 2680 West Main Street

| |
|--|
| Presented By: Andrea Mimnaugh, AICP, Principal Planner |
|--|

APPLICATION SUMMARY:

| | |
|--------------------------------------|--|
| Project Name: | Blue Ribbon Stables and Bussard Motor Company |
| Historic Name: | 2670 W Main Street -Blue Ribbon Stables 2680 W Main Street -Bussard Motor Company |
| Current Name: | ViewHouse |
| Application Type: | Certificate of Historic Appropriateness (COA) |
| Location: | 2670 - 2680 W Main Street |
| Designation: | Both properties are in the Main Street Historic District |
| Applicable Design Guidelines: | <u>2670 W Main Street</u> Blue Ribbon Stables (Non-Contributing Structure) <i>Littleton Downtown Design Standards and Guidelines</i> <u>2680 W Main Street</u> Bussard Motor Company (Contributing Structure) <i>Historic Preservation Design Guidelines and</i> <i>Littleton Downtown Design Standards and Guidelines</i> |
| Applicant: | Johnny Coast, 2670-80 W Main Street, LLC |
| Owner: | Francois Safieddine |
| Project Description: | As-Built Changes: 1) the addition of a walk-in cooler on the rear patio between the trash enclosure and the Bussard building and (2) storefront window replacement on the Bussard Building with revised transom design |

Proposed changes: 1) screening for the HVAC installed 13' from the front facade of Blue Ribbon Stables and 4) the addition of a fire access ladder

Staff Recommendation: **APPROVAL**, with two conditions identified in the analysis, below

PROCESS

Per Section 4-6-14(A)l(a), A COA shall be obtained from the Historical Preservation Board (HPB), in conformance with any applicable adopted design guidelines, and in addition to any other permit or other approval required by this code for any designated historic landmark structure or any property in a designated historic district.

The COA addresses both the Blue Ribbon Stables at 2670 West Main Street (the east building) and the Bussard Motor Company building at 2680 West Main Street (the west building). Because the Blue Ribbon Stables (2670 / east) is a non-contributing building and the Bussard Motor Company building (2680 / west) is contributing building, two sets of design guidelines must be used for reviewing this COA. The Littleton Downtown Design Standards and Guidelines apply to the non-contributing structure, the Blue Ribbon Stables (2670), and the Historic Preservation Design Guidelines apply to the contributing building, the Bussard Motor Company building (2680).

Three COA applications have been previously approved for the Blue Ribbon and Bussard Buildings:

- 1) **2012** - COA allowed changes to the front elevation that would accommodate four retail spaces and one office space in the two buildings. As approved, the renovated front façades retained the key elements of the two buildings. The renovated façades had two garage doors and five people doors. Paint was removed and the brick façade of the Bussard Motor Company building was restored. A new veneer face brick was installed on the front façade of the Blue Ribbon Stables. Service and garage doors were added to the rear of the two buildings. These changes were completed, although the owners did not move forward with retail uses.
- 2) **2014** - Designed to accommodate the ViewHouse restaurant and bar, the second COA allowed renovation that focused on the Bussard Motor Company building. A second story, rooftop deck and a rear patio were approved. To accommodate the rear patio, demolition of the rear of the existing two buildings was approved. Nana doors were approved as replacements for fixed glass windows and one of the two people doors. The garage door was replaced by two entry doors with sidelights. A deck over the barrel roof and a second floor addition were also approved, as was a revised rear façade with two glass garage doors that opened to the patio.
- 3) **2016** - After approval of the second COA, the owner's thoughts on the design and operations of the ViewHouse evolved, necessitating a third COA. The 2016 COA allowed the ViewHouse to expand to the east into the Blue Ribbon Stables, adding approximately 1100 square feet to the restaurant to accommodate a new patio bar, a new cooler, and a more efficient floor plan, without expanding the total square footage of the two buildings. To accommodate these changes, the COA allowed moving the front entry door to the east, from the Bussard Motor Company building into the Blue Ribbon Stables. The former, approved, location of the front entry door was replaced by a third set of Nana doors. The new front entry replaced two single doors and a column. To accommodate the new patio bar, a new metal roll-up door was added to the new south wall of the Blue Ribbon Stables. To improve the remaining space in the Blue Ribbon Stables, which may be used as an expansion for the View House or leased to a separate restaurant, two glass and

metal garage-type doors were added to the new south wall. The 2014 COA approved metal siding for the new wall that replaced the walls demolished to create the patio space in the rear of the building.

Staff and HPB (“board”) review are only two of the steps in the COA review process. If the board approves the COA application and the applicant meets all other city requirements, then the applicant can be issued a building permit for the project. If the board attaches condition(s) to the approval, a building permit will not be issued unless the condition(s) has been met. If the board denies the COA application, a building permit will not be issued for the project.

LOCATION

The Blue Ribbon Stables and Bussard Motor Company buildings are at 2670 and 2680 West Main Street, respectively. The buildings are on the south side of Main Street, on the west end of the block that extends between Curtice and Rapp Streets. Altitude Paddleboards (historic name: Littleton Electric) and Weston Masonic Lodge are immediately west of the buildings; a parking lot for the Elks Lodge and the Little Black Chair (historic name: Littleton Creamery) are south across the alley; Evoo Marketplace (the east side of Blue Ribbon Stables) is immediately east.



BACKGROUND

Per the 1997 Littleton Historic Buildings Survey (See Attachment # 8), the initial part of the Blue Ribbon Stables, the eastern of the two buildings at 2670 West Main Street, was erected between 1905 and 1908 as a small, rectangular commercial building. In 1908 or 1909, two larger masonry additions were erected adjoining the original building on the west, and two frame additions were built to the rear. By 1921, the eastern rear addition had been removed. Between 1932 and 1949, a small, narrow addition was added to the west front of

the building. During its history, the Blue Ribbon Stables building at 2670 West Main Street was divided into multiple storefronts with different uses, facades were remodeled, and the north façade was covered with non-historic cladding.

The contractors working on the recent renovation of the two buildings uncovered both early aerial photos and physical evidence that the Blue Ribbon Stables and the Bussard Motor Company building were at one time separated by what could be referred to as an “alley.”

Again, per the 1997 Littleton Historic Buildings Survey, the Bussard Motor Company building at 2680 West Main Street, the western of the two buildings, was constructed in 1929 for an automobile sales and service business. The building reflects auto dealership construction of the early twentieth century with its brick walls, stepped parapet, barrel roof, large garage entrances, and expansive display windows.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

See ATTACHMENT 7

CERTIFICATE OF HISTORIC APPROPRIATENESS ANALYSIS

Per Section 4-6-14 (C) of the Littleton City Code, the Historic Preservation Board shall issue a COA for any proposed work on a historic landmark or any property in a historic district when these five criteria are met:

CRITERION 1:

The proposed work would not detrimentally alter, destroy or adversely affect any architectural or landscape feature which contributes to its original historic designation.

ANALYSIS:

1) COOLER - NA

The 2014 COA review process determined the rear of the Bussard building was not historic, allowing a rear section of the building to be demolished and reconstructed with a new rear wall for the building and a patio behind it.

2) TRANSOM - YES, with a condition

The work completed on the front façade generally retains the most important architectural features of the two buildings, i.e., the vertical spacing and rhythm of the original storefronts and auto dealership with wide bays, a large percentage of the facades of both buildings devoted to transparent glass, and the strong horizontal elements. The Bussard building also had large plate glass display windows with fixed transom windows above them.

The issue to be addressed with the 2017 COA application is whether the Nano doors can be approved with the given changes and if the transom should be left open or covered with a metal insert. Staff believes that the structural form of the Nano doors does a good job of reflecting the historic form of a transom and transom window. However, despite the successful form and the benefit of additional light to the interior, staff believes that applying the metal inserts is critical to reinforcing the horizontal element of the building and, thus, meeting the COA criteria.

CONDITION:

The already-fabricated metal inserts be permanently applied to all of the Nano doors on the north façade of the

Bussard Motor Company building.

3) FIRE ACCESS - NA

Per a requirement from the city's fire marshal that a fire access stairway be added to provide an emergency connection to the roof of the second floor, a fire access stairway and railing will be installed on the new addition to the Bussard building, approved by the 2014 COA. It will not detract from any of the historic elements of the buildings.

4) HVAC - YES, with a condition

As located and constructed, the rooftop HVAC distracts from the strong horizontal character of both buildings and offsets the good design work done on the second story addition and the renovation of the façade. The design guidelines call for either setting rooftop equipment far enough back from the edge of the building that it cannot be seen from the sidewalk across the street or screening it.

CONDITION:

The north and east sides of the northernmost HVAC unit will be screened with the same metal screening used below the deck, which will be placed between 3' and 4' from the HVAC unit, will be painted the same color as the base of the deck, and which will be at least 6" taller than the HVAC's tallest point above grade.

CRITERION 2:

Is otherwise in conformance with any applicable adopted design guidelines.

STAFF: More detailed staff comments on the conformance of this proposed project with applicable design standards are included as ATTACHMENT 5.

APPLICANTS: The applicants' comments are included as ATTACHMENT 6

Because the Blue Ribbon Stables building (2670 West Main) is a non-contributing building and the Bussard Motor Company building (2680 West Main) is a contributing structure, different design guidelines apply. The Littleton Downtown Design Standards and Guidelines are used for non-contributing properties; i.e. 2670 West Main, and the Downtown Littleton Historic Preservation Design Guidelines are used for contributing properties, i.e. 2680 West Main. When the Downtown Littleton Historic Preservation Design Guidelines do not address a specific issue, then the review refers to the Littleton Downtown Design Standards and Guidelines.

BLUE RIBBON STABLES: Review of the changes to the Blue Ribbon Stables building (2670), which is a non-contributing building, is subject to the adopted design guidelines in the Littleton Downtown Design Standards and Guidelines. The categories of standards that apply to the proposed project can be found in the section of the guidelines that address solutions to treat individual building components:

- 5.1 General Subarea Character Statements: Existing and Desired
- 5.3 Architecture
- 5.3.5 Roof-Top Design / Mechanical Equipment Screening

SUMMARY REVIEW FOR CONFORMANCE WITH APPLICABLE GUIDELINES

1) **COOLER - NA** - The cooler is located behind the Bussard building.

2) **TRANSOM - NA** - The transoms are located on the Bussard building.

3) **FIRE ACCESS - NA** - There are no design guidelines that apply to the fire access ladder.

4) **HVAC - YES, with a condition** - The north and east sides of the northernmost HVAC unit will be screened with the same metal screening used below the deck, which will be placed between 3' and 4' from the HVAC unit, will be painted the same color as the base of the deck, and will be at least 6" taller than the HVAC's tallest point above grade.

BUSSARD MOTOR COMPANY: The changes to the Bussard Motor Company building (2680), which is a contributing building, are primarily reviewed for compatibility with the adopted Downtown Littleton Historic Preservation Design Guidelines. When the Downtown Littleton Historic Preservation Design Guidelines do not include guidance on a specific issue, the review refers to the Littleton Downtown Design Standards and Guidelines. On page vii Downtown Littleton Historic Preservation Design Guidelines, the enforceability of the guidelines is explained: "In this document the term 'guideline' is a criterion with which the City will require compliance, when it is found applicable to the specific proposal. In this sense it is a standard, albeit one that is subject to some interpretation when determining compliance. Where the term "shall" is used, compliance is specifically required, when the statement is applicable to the proposed action. The term "should" is frequently used in the guidelines. This indicates that compliance is expected, except in conditions in which the City finds that the guideline is not applicable, or that an alternative means of meeting the intent of the guideline is acceptable. In this sense, "should" means "shall." The phrase "may be considered" appears in some guidelines text. This indicates that the City has the discretion to determine if the action being discussed is appropriate. This decision is made on a case-by-case basis, using the information specifically related to the project and its context."

The categories of guidelines that apply to the proposed project can be found in the section of the guidelines that address solutions to treat individual building components:

- COMMERCIAL FACADES AND STOREFRONTS
- TREATMENT STRATEGIES FOR STOREFRONTS
- TREATMENT OF HISTORIC WINDOWS
- BUILDING MATERIALS
- SOLUTIONS FOR NEW MATERIALS ON HISTORIC BUILDINGS

1) **COOLER - YES**

The location and screening of the cooler conform to the applicable guidelines. While the electrical equipment on the roof of the cooler is taller than the adjoining walls, because of the distance it is set back from the alley, and because of all of the other structures and equipment between it and the alley, the impact is negligible.

2) **TRANSOM - YES, with a condition.**

The redesign of the transom windows, transoms, and Nano windows does a good job of reflecting the horizontal elements of the front façade of the Bussard building. Although the benefit of more light reaching the interior of the building is recognized, to conform to the applicable design guidelines, the strong horizontal elements of the façade should be reinforced and transom windows and transoms better reflected by permanently installing the already fabricated metal inserts.

CONDITION:

The already-fabricated metal inserts shall be permanently applied to all of the Nano doors on the north façade of the Bussard Motor Company building.

3) FIRE ACCESS - NA

The fire access is located on the Blue Ribbon Stables.

4) HVAC - NA

The HVAC unit in question is located on the Blue Ribbon Stables.

CRITERION 3:

The proposed work is visually compatible with designated historic structures located on the property in terms of design, finish, materials, scale, mass and height.

STAFF:

1) COOLER - YES

Because the cooler is located on the back of the Bussard building; because the back of that building is new, as are the materials used on the back; and because the cooler is well screened by walls, the trash enclosure, and the building, the cooler is visually compatible with the historic Bussard Motor Company building.

2) TRANSOM - YES, with a condition

The redesign of the transom windows, transoms, and Nano windows does a good job of reflecting the horizontal elements of the front façade of the historic Bussard building. Although the benefit of more light reaching the interior of the building is recognized, to conform to the applicable design guidelines, the strong horizontal elements of the façade should be reinforced and transom windows and transoms better reflected by permanently installing the already fabricated metal inserts.

CONDITION:

The already-fabricated metal inserts shall be permanently applied to all of the Nano doors on the north façade of the Bussard Motor Company building.

3) FIRE ACCESS - YES

The fire access stairway and railing will be installed on the new addition to the Bussard building, approved by the 2014 COA. Although it will not be screened, the stairway and railing are located toward the rear of the building and will not detract from any of the historic elements of the Blue Ribbon Stables.

4) HVAC - YES, with a condition

The northernmost HVAC unit on the Blue Ribbon Stable will be visually compatible with the historic Blue Ribbon Stables and Bussard building in terms of design, finish, materials, scale, mass and height only if it is adequately screened.

CONDITION:

The north and east sides of the northernmost HVAC unit will be screened with the same metal screening used below the deck, which will be placed between 3' and 4' from the HVAC unit, will be painted the same color as the base of the deck, and will be at least 6" taller than the HVAC's tallest point above grade. By using the same simple material, design, and dark color used for the screening below the second floor deck added to the Bussard building, screening the HVAC will create less distraction from the historic Blue Ribbon Stables and Bussard building.

CRITERION 4:

When the subject site is within a historic district, the board must find that the proposed work is visually compatible with the development on adjacent properties.

1) COOLER - YES

The cooler is adequately screened from adjacent properties and is compatible with development on adjacent properties.

2) TRANSOM - YES

The redesign of the windows and doors on the Bussard building and the addition of permanent metal inserts to the transoms help the Bussard building be visually compatible with adjacent development.

3) FIRE ACCESS - YES

The fire access stairway and railing will be located at the rear of the Bussard building, helping make it visually compatible with development on adjacent properties.

4) HVAC - YES, with a condition

Given its size, unusual shape, safety warnings, location, and visibility from adjacent properties, the HVAC will be compatible with adjoining properties only if it is adequately screened. By using the same simple material, design, and dark color used for the screening below the second floor deck added to the Bussard building, screening the HVAC will help assure the compatibility of the HVAC unit with the development on adjacent properties

CONDITION:

The north and east sides of the northernmost HVAC unit will be screened with the same metal screening used below the deck, which will be placed between 3' and 4' from the HVAC unit, will be painted the same color as the base of the deck, and will be at least 6" taller than the HVAC's tallest point above grade.

CRITERION 5: NA - None of the four projects include partial demolition.

With partial demolitions, the board must find that the:

- a) Partial demolition is required for the renovation, restoration or rehabilitation of the structure, and
- b) Impacts on the historic importance and architectural integrity of the structure/s on the property have been mitigated to the greatest extent possible.

The four projects do not include partial demolition.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff finds that, in compliance with Section 4-6-14(C) of the Littleton City Code, the proposed Certificate of Historic Appropriateness for 2670 and 2680 West Main Street meets the criteria for approval, with two conditions included in the proposed motion. Staff, therefore, recommends approval of HPB Resolution 13-2017, with the stated conditions, approving the Certificate of Historic Appropriateness for 2670 and 2680 West Main Street.

PROPOSED MOTION:

The historical preservation board may take the following actions on the application: approve; approve with conditions; continue to a date certain; and deny. A sample motion is provided for each option.

MOTION TO APPROVE AND/IF NECESSARY, WITH CONDITIONS

I move to approve HPB Resolution 13-2017, approving the Certificate of Historic Appropriateness for 2670 West Main Street, Blue Ribbon Stables, and 2680 West Main Street, the Bussard Motor Company building, with the following condition(s):

1. The already-fabricated metal inserts shall be permanently applied to all of the Nano doors on the north façade of the Bussard Motor Company building, at 2680 West Main Street.
2. The north and east sides of the northernmost HVAC unit will be screened with the same metal screening used below the deck, which will be placed between 3' and 4' from the HVAC unit, will be painted the same color as the base of the deck, and will be at least 6" taller than the HVAC's tallest point above grade.

MOTION TO CONTINUE TO A DATE CERTAIN

I move to continue the public hearing on HPB Resolution 13-2017, concerning the certificate of historic appropriateness for 2670 West Main Street, Blue Ribbon Stables, and 2680 West Main Street, the Bussard Motor Company building, to _____ (insert date) in order to _____.

MOTION TO DENY

I move to deny HPB Resolution 13-2017, concerning the certificate of historic appropriateness at 2670 West Main Street, Blue Ribbon Stables, and 2680 West Main Street, the Bussard Motor Company building. The foregoing denial is based on the findings that the proposed work:

Note: Identify criterion or criteria not met and adjust motion accordingly:

1. does not/**does** detrimentally alter, destroy or adversely affect any architectural or landscape feature which contributes to the original historic designation;
2. is/**is not** in conformance with the Littleton Downtown Design Standards and Guidelines;
3. is/**is not** visually compatible with designated historic structures located on the property in terms of design, finish, material, scale, mass and height; and
4. is/**is not** visually compatible with the development on adjacent properties.