

Agenda Date: 11/17/2014

Subject:

..Title

Continued from October 20, 2014 - Bussard Motor Company COA Application

..Body

Presented By: Dennis Swain, Senior Planner
--

POLICY QUESTION:

With the changes made by the applicant at the request of the board at the public hearing held on October 20, 2014, does the proposed project, which includes alterations to the front facade the Bussard Motor Company building, the partial demolition of the rear of the building, and the addition of a partial second floor and an outdoor deck, meet the criteria for a Certificate of Appropriateness?

BACKGROUND:

This is a continuation of a public hearing held on October 20, 2014. At the conclusion of that hearing, the board asked the applicant to submit a modified application that responds to a list of ten clarifications, alternatives, and revisions. A list of the revisions requested by the board is provided at the end of this section of the Staff Communication. Design Sheets 2B, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 9B, 10, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, and 19 have been revised in response to the board's request. The revised sheets have replaced the original sheets in the application.

The following is the description of the project as it has been revised in response to the ten items requested by the Historical Preservation Board.

The Bussard Motor Company building, located at 2680 West Main Street, is owned by 2670-80 W Main Street LLC, which intends to use the space for a View House restaurant. As a contributing structure in the Main Street Historic District, the Bussard Motor Company building is subject to the Downtown Littleton Historic Preservation Design Guidelines.

The owners have applied for a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish 1,567 square feet from the rear of the structure and, on the second floor, construct a 2,039 square foot addition and an open deck to the north and west of the addition. The ground-level open area created by the demolition will be improved for an outdoor patio and volleyball area. Following the demolition and new construction, the resulting interior space will include 4,648 square feet on the first floor and 2,039 square feet on the second, for a total of 6,687 square feet of interior space. Additionally, there will be a 2,320 square foot second floor outdoor deck.

The second floor addition and deck will float above the barrel roof of the historic building so that the roof will be protected. The existing skylights will be retained and artificially lighted as one of the light sources for the ground floor uses. The second floor addition and the bar extension will be set back 18'4" from the parapet on the north edge of the first floor, the bar extension will be set back 13'2" from the parapet on the west edge of the first floor, the main addition will be set back 21'6" from the west parapet, and the railing around the deck will be set back 3'0" from the front parapet

and behind the west parapet. These setbacks will help distinguish the new from the historic and minimize the visual impact of the second floor addition on the historic structure.

To the same end, the second floor addition will have a simple box form with a flat roof. Additionally, the flat metal siding on the bar extension, the horizontal extruded-rib metal siding on the main addition, and the metal railing around the deck will be painted in a dark tone to reinforce the subordinate visual role of the new second floor. The north and west walls of the addition will have a series of glass garage doors that open to connect the interior and exterior spaces during warmer weather and, when closed during cooler or wetter weather, provide walls of natural light for the inside and a view of the activity within. The garage doors on the 15' tall primary structure will be 12' tall and the five on the 12' tall bar extension 9' tall. Additionally, there will be two 10' tall glass pedestrian doors, one on the northeast corner of the addition and the second on the southwest corner.

The front (north) façade of the historic building will be altered slightly from the façade approved as part of a 2012 Certificate of Appropriateness. However, these changes, the historic rhythm of solid and void (walls and windows), will be retained. The principal changes to the front façade of the historic building include:

- On the east end of the façade, the garage door will be replaced by a recessed main entry with two 8' doors, two 8' tall sidelights, three spandrel panels, and four fixed-glass transom windows. The opening for the recessed entry will be improved with a higher grade finish to better match the rest of the façade. The finish of the entry is detailed on the revised Design Sheet 15.
- The second opening to the west was approved as a 7' door, a spandrel panel, and a fixed-glass transom window. This will be replaced by an 8' door, a smaller spandrel panel, and a fixed-glass transom window. This is a secondary door that could serve sidewalk seating.
- The third opening to the west was approved with two fixed-glass windows, a new 7' door, three spandrel panels above the door and windows, and three fixed-glass transom windows. The proposal is to replace the two fixed-glass panels and door with a four-panel 6'10" high Nana window, two spandrel panels, and three fixed-glass transom windows. As part of the replacement of the door with a Nana window, the bottom of the door opening will be filled-in with brick to match the other window sills.
- The westernmost of the four openings was approved with two fixed-glass windows, two spandrel panels, and three fixed-glass transom windows. The proposal is to replace the two fixed-glass panels with a four-panel 6'10" high Nana window, two spandrel panels, and three fixed-glass transom windows.
- All of the existing tinted glass will be replaced with clear glass.

The remainder of the front façade, including the sign location and parapet, will remain as it was approved in 2012.

The rear (south) façade of the building will undergo a total transformation. The entire south wall

will be demolished to provide outdoor space. The new south façade will have two sections, with the western section extending farther south than the eastern section. The western section will be dominated by an exterior metal stairway that connects the second floor deck and restaurant/bar space with the newly created ground-level outdoor space. The 42" high stair guard / handrail will be constructed of the same materials and with a design based on the guardrail around the second floor deck. Two 7' high metal doors will provide access to the interior food service and storage areas. The first floor of the eastern section will have two 9' high glass garage doors that will provide light for the dining area and access between the dining area and the outdoor space. There will also be a 7' high glass pedestrian door that will provide alternative access between the dining area and the outdoor space. The second floor of the eastern section of the south façade will have a single 9' high fixed-glass window, with the proportions and design of a garage door, to provide light for the rear interior stairway and the second floor restaurant/bar space. Both the first and second floor of the new south façade will be covered with the same horizontal extruded-rib metal siding that will cover the other three sides of the second floor addition, with the exception of the bar extension which will have flat metal siding.

The east first floor wall of the building abuts the Blue Ribbon Stable building and is not visible. The east wall of the second floor addition is above the roof of the Blue Ribbon Stable and will have six fixed-pane vertical windows. The owner has combined what historically were two parcels (2670 and 2680) into a single parcel so that there can be windows on this side of the second floor addition. The east wall of the second floor addition will have horizontal extruded-rib metal siding.

There will be a 6' high stucco-on-concrete wall constructed around the new open area at the rear of the site. The revised Sheet 2B shows a single gate connecting the open area to the alley. The trash enclosure at the west end of the open area will have a single gate to the open area and a double gate to the alley so that the trash dumpster can be easily emptied and returned. Two new grease traps will be accessed from the open area, but outside of the volley ball area. A second grease trap is being provided in case 2570 is also used as a restaurant.

The following is the list of revisions the board asked the applicant to make to the original application:

1. Provide colors and values that blend with the existing building
2. Update the renderings with all actual and proposed colors and materials
3. Replace the metal coiling garage doors on the bar extension with glass garage doors
4. Replace the 12' view with a pedestrian level view of the second floor addition
5. Explore the option of a rendering with a solid wall enclosing the barrel roof under the deck on the west and east facades
6. Address all of the questions and comments in the consultants' memorandum (see attached).
7. Update the railing in the rendering on page 18 to reflect the elevation on page 6
8. Clarify the second floor siding – direction, color and scale
9. Make the exterior railings as transparent as possible
10. Simplify the second floor addition and deck elements and review elements such as the eyebrow on the bar extension

STAFF ANALYSIS:

Staff has reviewed the amended proposal for the Bussard Motor Company building for its response to the revisions requested by the board and for its consistency with the criteria for a Certificate of Historic Appropriateness (COA), as specified in Section 4-6-14(C).

a) The proposed work would not detrimentally alter, destroy or adversely affect any architectural or landscape feature which contributes to its original historic designation and is otherwise in conformance with any applicable adopted design guidelines.

The proposed demolition and addition to the Bussard Motor Company building will not detrimentally alter, destroy, or adversely affect any architectural or landscape feature that contributes to the original historic designation and the project is otherwise in conformance with the Downtown Littleton Historic Preservation Design Guidelines.

Consistent with the Design Guidelines, the alterations proposed to the front façade of the Bussard Motor Company building will preserve the character-defining historic elements typical of this and other Main Street storefronts, including:

- A rhythm of solid and void typical of early automobile showrooms and repair garages;
- Brick;
- Glassed storefront with display windows and transom features;
- Recessed entry; and
- Cornice with simple details, including recessed panels and corbelling.

The project is also consistent with the recommendations for additions to historic structures, which state that an addition should:

- Minimize the loss of historically significant features;
- Be compatible with the main building; and
- Minimize the visual impacts of skylights and other rooftop devices.

Consistent with these recommendations, the proposed addition:

- Is set back from both the north and west facades of the building and will not visually impact the key historic features of the original building;
- Has simple, but strong, horizontal elements and a rhythm of solid and void, both of which reflect key characteristics of the historic structure;
- Has dark tones that will be compatible with, but visually subordinate to, the tones of the historic structure;
- Includes contemporary interpretations of key characteristics of the historic structure, including glass garage doors, a fixed window with the proportions and design of a garage door, and fixed-glass transom windows above the two pedestrian doors; and
- Locates the HVAC, stacks, and vents so they will not be not visible from the street or sidewalk

Prior to the October 20, 2014, public hearing, the city's development review and historic preservation consultants, Deana Swetlik of Entelechy Design, and Fred Andreas, of Unit Design Studio, met twice with the applicant to review the proposal in light of the design guidelines.

Following their first meeting, the applicant made changes requested by the consultants. At their second meeting, the applicant presented the changes and the consultants reviewed whether the changes met their intent. The consultants' comments, as they were presented and discussed at the October 20 public hearing, are attached. The revisions provided by the applicant address all of these comments.

b) The proposed work is visually compatible with designated historic structures located on the property in terms of design, finish, material, scale, mass and height.

The proposed addition to 2680 West Main Street has been located and designed to highlight and be visually compatible with the historic Bussard Motor Company building. The second floor addition floats above the barrel roof. It is designed so that:

- The existing skylights are retained and illuminated to provide light to the interior;
- The deck is set back 3' from the front (north) parapet and set behind the west parapet so that it does not visually interfere with these historic features;
- The second floor addition is set back 18' from the front parapet and 13'2" from the west parapet so that it is obviously a secondary element to the historic ground floor structure;
- The second floor is clearly secondary to the main structure as it covers only 44% of the second floor and does not detract from the pedestrian perspective on either side of the street; and
- The abundant use of glass lightens the structure, while the dark colors and simple design are compatible with the historic structure and allow the addition to take a secondary position to the original building.

The proposed changes to the front façade not only retain the rhythm of solid and void (walls and windows), they also enhance the façade approved in 2012 by closing a door that was added to the original building and filling in the sill to reclaim the original form.

At the end of the October 20 public hearing, the board asked the applicant to explore the option of enclosing the structure that supports the deck. Because the interior of the renovated structure will feature the historic barrel ceiling, including the original skylights, because the view of the barrel roof of the historic building may be limited from street level, and because the benefits of the proposed enclosure outweigh those of leaving the structure open, staff is supportive of this revision.

The board also asked the applicant to simplify the second floor addition, replace the metal coiling garage doors on the bar extension with glass garage doors, make the exterior railings as transparent as possible, and choose dark paint and finish tones and values that will blend with, and be subordinate to, the historic building. Staff is supportive of these revisions.

c) The proposed work is visually compatible with the development on adjacent properties.

The altered first floor façade, the new second floor deck, the second floor addition, and the exterior materials are all visually compatible with the development on nearby properties. As defined in the Historic Preservation Code, the term "compatible" means consistent with, harmonious with, and/or

enhances the mixture of complementary architectural styles either of the architecture of an individual structure or the character of the surrounding structures. The properties on the 2600 block of West Main Street are diverse in their historic uses, architectural styles, and materials. The block is capped by the stately Carnegie Library building, but also has buildings with historic and current agricultural and auto-related uses and buildings that have parking on their front and sides. Although the structures on the block are predominantly one-story commercial structures, there are four two-story buildings on the block, including two immediately to the west of the Bussard building. The work proposed by this COA application will enhance the surrounding structures' mixture of architectural styles.

The block contains:

- One two-story building with a second story that is set back to allow outdoor space for a restaurant;
- Several buildings with historic or current auto-related uses;
- Several buildings with current agricultural-related uses;
- Several sites with parking to the front or side of the primary structures, including one with a small two-story structure;
- One metal building; and
- Several properties that may see future redevelopment proposals.

In the case of partial demolitions, the partial demolition is required for the renovation, restoration or rehabilitation of the structure and impacts on the historic importance and architectural integrity of the structure(s) located on the property have been mitigated to the greatest extent possible.

The partial demolition of the rear of the structure is required for its renovation and use as a restaurant. By limiting the demolition to the rear of the building, the impacts have been mitigated to the greatest extent possible.

Update:

Staff has also reviewed the applicant's response to the ten requests the Board made at the end of the October 20, 2014 public hearing. The applicant has provided revised design sheets that are included as part of the current application. The ten requests and the applicant's responses are:

1. Provide colors and values that blend with the existing building
The applicant has revised the proposed tones and values to better blend with the existing building. See revised Sheets 16 – 19.
2. Update the renderings with all actual and proposed colors and materials
The applicant has done this. See the modified renderings on revised Sheets 16 – 18.
3. Replace the metal coiling garage doors on the bar extension with glass garage doors
The building with glass garage doors can be seen on revised Sheets 5, 6, 8, 17, and 18.
4. Replace the 12' view with a pedestrian-level view of the second floor addition
See revised Sheet 18 for the new pedestrian-level view of the front and west facades, as they would look with the changes requested by the Board.

5. Explore the option of a rendering with a solid wall enclosing the barrel roof under the deck on the west and east facades
This option is shown on revised Sheets 5, 6, 7, 17, and 18.
6. Address all of the questions and comments in the consultants' memorandum (see attached).
The applicant has responded to the consultants' request for clarification and additional details on the materials, tone, and design of the recessed entry with a revised Sheet 15.
Similarly, the applicant has responded to the consultants' request for additional details on the finish of the new second floor doors and windows with a revised Sheet 16.
7. Update the railing in the rendering on page 18 to reflect the elevation on page 6
The applicant has revised the rendering and elevation of the railing to match one another. See revised Sheets 5, 6, 7, 8, 17, and 18 for the updates.
8. Clarify the second floor siding – direction, color and scale
The second floor siding is shown on revised Sheets 5, 6, 7, and 8 and the direction, tone, and scale are detailed on revised Sheets 16 and 19.
9. Make the exterior railings as transparent as possible
The design, dimensions, and materials of the railing are detailed on revised Sheet 9B.
10. Simplify the second floor addition and deck elements and review elements such as the eyebrow on the bar extension
The applicant has removed the eyebrow on the bar extension, enclosed the base of the second floor deck, and darkened the tone of the second floor addition, deck, and railing to help simplify them and help minimize their visual impact on the historic first floor. See revised Sheets 5, 6, 8, 16, 17, 18, and 19.

Staff finds that the applicant has responded accurately and thoroughly to the Board's requested changes and considerations and that the application still meets the criteria for a Certificate of Historic Appropriateness (COA), as specified in Section 4-6-14(C).

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of the proposed Certificate of Historic Appropriateness for the Bussard Motor Company Building at 2680 West Main Street.

PROPOSED MOTION:

..Proposed Motion

Motion to approve the Bussard Motor Company Certificate of Historic Appropriateness, located at 2680 West Main Street in the Main Street Historic District, for the partial demolition of the building, , and the addition of a partial second floor and an outdoor deck in order to accommodate a two-story restaurant with outdoor space, as described in detail in the revised application and its supporting attachments, as they were presented and approved at the November 17, 2014 public hearing.

